

**I. IDENTIFICATION DATA**

<b>Thesis name:</b>	<b>Off the Grid Integrated Communal Living</b>
<b>Author's name:</b>	<b>Akshata Vadvagli</b>
<b>Type of thesis :</b>	diploma
<b>Faculty/Institute:</b>	Fakulta architektury (FA)
<b>Department:</b>	UNII
<b>Thesis reviewer:</b>	doc.ing.arch. Petr Kordovský
<b>Reviewer's department:</b>	FA ČVUT

**II. EVALUATION OF INDIVIDUAL CRITERIA**

<b>Assignment</b>	<b>challenging</b>
<i>Evaluation of thesis difficulty of assignment.</i>	
<p>The assignment is extremely valuable under Indian conditions as far I was able to understand. The complexity of enhancing the living standard incorporating the traditional ways of housing both in technical, typological and sociocultural sense is a tremendous task. The pressure of the rapidly growing city suffering from massive influx of newcomers from rural areas can lead to totalitarian solutions so well-known from e.g. Chinese cities of today. The solution offered by Akshata offers more sensible solution maintaining demand for both high density and human scale.</p>	

<b>Satisfaction of assignment</b>	<b>fulfilled</b>
<i>Assess that handed thesis meets assignment. Present points of assignment that fell short or were extended. Try to assess importance, impact or cause of each shortcoming.</i>	
<p>Again ,the monumental analytical part of the work show us many possibilities how to deal with the challenge described. The proposed task is to overhaul the existing environment into a better status residences preferably giving the opportunity to the same people. That is a bit doubtful presumption based on the experience... But when have we appropriate time to assume that than during our studies! The project is stronger in sociocultural aspects than architectural but being able to do both in full needs experience. The ambition is important.</p>	

<b>Method of conception</b>	<b>correct</b>
<i>Assess that student has chosen correct approach or solution methods.</i>	
<p>The whole story starts with very thorough analytical work which we were witnessing during the pre diploma seminar period. Understanding all the aspects influencing life in general and housing in detail in a big Indian city is the base stone for the project. Maybe finding the right connection between analytical and design part of the work is the basic problem of similar projects. You must find the place where to stop interpreting your findings in detail and to start designing the concept with certain level of generalisation and artistic input. The concept is in fact a 3D interpretation of all those Kucchas and Puccas from the analysis. It is hard to decide whether it is right or wrong from the safety and peace of our Central European armchairs...Let us decide it is right at least as end of the road solution.</p>	

**Technical level**

**D - satisfactory.**

*Assess level of thesis specialty, use of knowledge gained by study and by expert literature, use of sources and data gained by experience.*

Approach to technical solution is maybe in the shadow of all this typological wizardry described in the analytical part of the project. Structural solutions are overkilled a bit in sake of the possible rebuilding/extensions of the whole structure. Let us remind ourselves about the present time situation of all those brave Metabolist stories in e.g. Japan – they are mostly intact today in the same way they were built. If they has not been demolished... Infrastructure mains within such complex would be an enormous problem. On the other end I think opponent's remark about the single garages is logical but not in accord with today's India love affair with the automobile. I must appreciate the (in our conditions probably both legally and socially) not possible close distance of the units enabling the inhabitants to communicate directly – window to window as is a rule in traditional Indian society.

**Formal and language level, scope of thesis**

**B - very good.**

*Assess correctness of usage of formal notation. Assess typographical and language arrangement of thesis.*

The booklet and posters are easy to read helping to understand rather complicated idea of the project. Let me point on developing diagrams of the whole compound and individual units. The remarks and citations ending the thesis are a rare sight in diploma projects.

**III. OVERALL EVALUATION, QUESTIONS FOR DEFENSE, CLASSIFICATION SUGGESTION**

*Summarize thesis aspects that swayed your final evaluation. Please present apt questions which student should answer during defence.*

I appreciate Akshata empathy and idealism transformed into this complicated try to help people in need. Widely spread problem of overpopulated areas in rapidly evolving cities of the developing world cannot be left just to market forces and Darwinist forces. It is easy to design a nice house in encouraging environment – but does it help anybody?

Transforming the idea into a project need a lot of effort and focus. I am happy to witness this process in our last semester studio. Technical mistakes occurred, you probably cannot be smitten with the elegance of the design, but the goal, effort and stubbornness of the candidate was crowned with the result you can argue about, but would remember for a long time.

**Questions:**

- 1) Do you have any idea how to handle the resettled inhabitants during the reconversion supposing it will be the same people.
- 2) Are there any successful cases of this deep reconversion of an inhabited area in India?
- 3) Are there any financial tools to help this kind of residential reconversion?

I evaluate handed thesis with classification grade **C - good.**

Date: **30.6.2020**

Signature: Petr Kordovský

